

Message Text

SECRET

PAGE 01 MOSCOW 16496 01 OF 02 291943Z

47 42

ACTION SS-25

INFO OCT-01 ISO-00 SSO-00 NSCE-00 CIAE-00 DODE-00 INRE-00

AECE-00 /026 W

----- 028062

O 291603Z OCT 74

FM AMEMBASSY MOSCOW

TO SECSTATE WASHDC IMMEDIATE 4065

S E C R E T SECTION 1 OF 2 MOSCOW 16496

EXDIS

C O R R E C T E D C O P Y (TEXT)

E.O. 11652 XGDS-3

TAGS: PARM, US, UR, OEXD

SUBJ: TTBT/PNE NEGOTIATIONS - SUMMARY OF OCT 29 PLENARY

PNE MESSAGE NUMBER THIRTY-SIX

1. MOROKHOV OPENED BY STATING THIS IS OUR ELEVENTH MEETING,
ASKED WHEN THE TWELFTH MEETING SHOULD BE HELD. IT WAS DECIDED
TO HOLD IT TOMORROW, OCTOBER 30, AT 1030 HOURS.

2. MOROKHOV SAID MYASNIKOV WOULD NOW CONTINUE DISCUSSIONS
ORIGINATING AFTER HIS REPORT ON THE PURPOSE OF EXPLOSIONS
AND THEIR YIELDS.

3. MYASNIKOV THEN READ PREPARED STATEMENT. REFERRED TO
REPORT OF FLEMING OF OCTOBER 25 CONTAINING REMARKS AND
QUESTIONS ABOUT HIS REPORT OF OCTOBER 23. HE WANTED TO
CLEAR UP FLEMING'S DOUBTS ABOUT THE UTILITY OF SUCH LOW
YIELDS AS 2.5 KT. REFERRED TO THEIR OIL STIMULATION
EXPERIENCE - THREE EXPLOSIVES, TWO AT 2.3 KT AND ONE AT
88 KT. RESULTS WERE A 50-60 PERCENT INCREASE IN
PRODUCTION. ALSO GAINED VALUABLE SCIENTIFIC AND
TECHNICAL EXPERIENCE AT THE SAME TIME. SAME THING CAN
BE SAID ABOUT CREATION OF STORAGE CAVITIES. DATA GIVEN

SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 02 MOSCOW 16496 01 OF 02 291943Z

IN EARLIER MYASNIKOV REPORT DERIVED FROM ACTUAL

EXPERIENCE IN ROCK SALT. SOVIET REPORTS SHOWED COSTS REDUCED BY 3 TIMES, METALS REQUIREMENTS BY 10, AREA OF WASTED LAND BY 2000, TIME OF CONSTRUCTION LESS. YIELDS 2-3 TIMES LOWER THAN THOSE PRESENTED BY FLEMING CAN STILL BE ECONOMIC. REFERENCED KETCH AT 24 KT. REFERENCED FLEMING'S STATEMENT ABOUT STORAGE OF RADWASTES AT 10 KT, AND EXPRESSED WISH TO KNOW MORE ABOUT QUOTE THIS PROJECT UNQUOTE. YIELDS FOR RUNAWAY GUSHERS DETERMINED NOT ONLY BY DEPTH AND ROCK CHARACTER BUT ALSO BY ACCURACY OF DETERMINATION OF DISTANCE OF THE EXPLOSIVE TO THE WELL BORE. FOR MINING, IF BIG DEPOSITS ARE FOUND AT GREAT DEPTH, THEN 100 KT OR YIELDS LARGER THAN 100 KT MIGHT BE NEEDED IN FUTURE. EXPERIMENT SHOWN IN FILM REQUIRED ONLY A SMALL YEILD. THE US SLOOP STUDY REQUIRED 20 KT. IN MAJORITY OF ENGINEERING PROJECTS FOR CANALS, TRANSPORTATION CUTS, MULTIPLE EXPLOSIONS ARE REQUIRED. LENGTHS OF SEVERAL KILOMETERS TO TENS OF KILOMETERS ARE REQUIRED.

4. FLEMING ASKED WHETHER THE TWO 2.3 KT OIL STIMULATIONS WERE SIMULATANEIOUS. REPLY WAS THEY WERE SEPARATED BY DAYS.

5. FLEMING ASKED IF THEY HAVE PLANS FOR TWO OR MORE SIMULTANEOUS EXPLOSIONS IN A CONTAINED MODE. MOROKHOV SAID HE WOULD NOT PRECLUDE POSSIBILITY, BUT THEY HAVE NO PLANS FOR THE NEAR FUTURE.

6. FLEMING ASKED IF TWO OR MORE CONTAINED SIMULTANEOUS EXPLOSIONS WOULD HAVE AGGREGATE YEILD OF GREATER THAN 100 KT MOROKHOV SAID SAFRONOV OR RADIONOV WOULD ANSWER LATER.

7. FLEMING MADE GENERAL COMMENTS ABOUT ECONOMICS OF LOW YIELDS AND CONCLUDED THAT POSITIONS OF US AND USSR NOT VERY DIFFERENT.

8. MOROKHOV SAID LOW YIELDS ARE NOT INCLUDED IN THE FRAMEWORK OF OUR INTERESTS OF VERIFICATION AND CONTROL. ON LARGE YIELDS WE COULD EXCHANGE VIEWS IN COOPERATION.
SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 03 MOSCOW 16496 01 OF 02 291943Z

9. STOESSEL STATEMENT: QUOTE:
(COMPLIMENTARY REMARKS)

WE WOULD LIKE TO ACKNOWLEDGE MR. TIMERBAEV'S STATEMENT LAST FRIDAY CONCERNING THE NATURE OF A POSSIBLE AGREEMENT ON NUCLEAR EXPLOSIONS FOR PEACEFUL PURPOSES. WE ARE NOT PREPARED, AS YET, TO EITHER ACCEPT OR REJECT HIS FORMULATION AS A BASIS FOR A

PNE AGREEMENT. NEVERTHELESS WE WANT TO ASSURE YOU THAT WE ARE STUDYING MR. TIMERBAEV'S PRESENTATION CAREFULLY, PARTICULARLY FROM THE PERSPECTIVE OF HOW SUCH AN AGREEMENT COULD SATISFY THE CRITERIA AND CONCERNS WHICH WE HAVE IDENTIFIED EARLIER. THESE ARE, BRIEFLY, THAT PNES MUST BE FOR PEACEFUL PURPOSES ONLY AND MUST NOT PROVIDE WEAPON-RELATED BENEFITS OTHERWISE PRECLUDED OR LIMITED BY THE TTBT, AND THAT THIS MUST BE ADEQUATELY VERIFIABLE. FURTHER, THE AGREEMENT MUST BE CONSISTENT WITH EXISTING TREATY OBLIGATIONS, INCLUDING IN PARTICULAR THE LIMITED TEST BAN TREATY OF 1963.

WE WISH TO STRESS THAT WE THINK THAT COOPERATION IS NECESSARY IN THE EXCHANGE OF SUFFICIENTLY DETAILED INFORMATION TO SUPPORT VERIFICATION UNDER ARTICLE III OF THE TREATY OF JULY 3, 1974.

IT ALSO SEEMS TO US THAT THERE ARE ELEMENTS THAT WOULD APPEAR IN ANY ADEQUATE PNE AGREEMENT AND COULD BE PROFITABLY DISCUSSED AT THIS TIME. ONE SUCH ITME WOULD BE AN UNDERSTANDING LIMITING UNDERGROUND CONTAINED PNES TO A MAXIMUM AGGREGATE YIELD OF ONE HUNDRED KILO- TONS. IF YOU AGREE, THIS IS SOMETHING WE COULD PURSUE TOGETHER. WE PROPOSE TO INITIATE DISCUSSION ON THIS TOPIC AND ITS ASSOCIATED VERIFICATION REQUIREMENTS AT AN EARLY MEETING AND WOULD WELCOME YOUR COMMENTS ON IT ALONG WITH ANY OTHER SUCH SPECIFIC ELEMENTS YOU MAY WISH TO SUGGEST.

MR. MINISTER, THAT CONCLUDES OUR PRESENTATION FOR TODAY. DO YOU HAVE ANY FURTHER REMARKS? END QUOTE.

10. STOESSEL SAID ROMNEY HAD ASKED QUESTIONS AT A
SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 04 MOSCOW 16496 01 OF 02 291943Z

PREVIOUS PLENARY AND ASKED IF WE COULD EXPECT ANSWERS AT A SUBSEQUENT MEETING. MOROKHOV SAID ANSWERS WOULD BE PROVIDED AT ONE OF OUR SUBSEQUENT MEETINGS.

11. MOROKHOV RESPONDED TO STOESSEL'S STATEMENT REGARDING POSSIBLE AGREEMENT BY BOTH SIDES TO LIMIT CONTAINED AGGREGATE YIELDS TO 100 KT BY STATING THAT SUCH LIMITATIONS CANNOT BE THE BASIS FOR AN AGREEMENT BECAUSE IN PRINCIPLE THE SOVIET SIDE ADMITS TO NO LIMITS ON THE YIELD AND NUMBER OF PNES. THE SOVIET SIDE IS NEVERTHELESS READY TO LISTEN TO US OBSERVATIONS, THOUGH IT CANNOT SAY IN ADVANCE THAT SUCH A PROVISION WOULD BE ACCEPTABLE.

12. MOROKHOV THEN STATED: QUOTE:

I DETECTED A POSITIVE ELEMENT IN YOUR STATEMENT THAT IN ORDER TO HAVE ALL-ENCOMPASSING INFORMATION YOU WILL NEED COOPERATION BETWEEN THE US AND SOVIET SIDES. THIS IS A POSITIVE POINT AND ON THIS BASIS WE CAN CONTINUE TO WORK. UNQUOTE. (THE ABOVE QUOTATION WAS IMPROPERLY TRANSLATED BY SOVIET INTERPRETER AND IS DERIVED FROM OUR OWN RUSSIAN-SPEAKING MEMBERS.) THE STATEMENT SUGGESTS THAT OUR STATEMENT ON THE NEED FOR COOPERATION IN EXCHANGING VIEWS WAS MISINTERPRETED BY SOVIETS AS SUPPORTING THEIR CONTENTION THAT FULL EXCHANGE OF VERIFICATION INFORMATION REQUIRES COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT. WE WILL MAKE US VIEW CLEAR IN TOMORROW'S PLENARY.

13. MOROKHOV PROMISED PRESENTATIONS BY RODINOV AND NIVIKOV TOMORROW TO ANSWER ROMNEY QUESTIONS. MEETING ADJOURNED AT 1650.

SECRET

NNN

SECRET

PAGE 01 MOSCOW 16496 02 OF 02 291645Z

42

ACTION SS-25

INFO OCT-01 ISO-00 SSO-00 NSCE-00 CIAE-00 DODE-00 INRE-00

AECE-00 /026 W

----- 026411

O 291603Z OCT 74

FM AMEMBASSY MOSCOW

TO SECSTATE WASHDC IMMEDIATE 4066

S E C R E T SECTION 2 OF 2 MOSCOW 16496

EXDIS

14. IN PRIVATE MEETING WITH STOESSEL, MOROKHOV STATED THAT SOVIET SIDE WAS INTERESTED IN CONSIDERING US VIEWS ON VERIFICATION OF CONTAINED PNES BELOW 100 KILOTONS. HE ALSO STATED THAT SOVIETS DID HAVE AN INTEREST IN SOME CONTAINED PNES OVER TTBT THRESHOLD, BUT WAS NOT PRECISE IN HIS COMMENTS. IN REPLY TO QUESTION ABOUT YIELDS AND NUMBERS OF LARGE EXCAVATION PNES, MOROKHOV SAID THAT THERE MIGHT BE

"UP TO FIVE" PER YEAR. HE DID NOT SPECIFY WHETHER HE MEANT SINGLE EXPLOSIONS OR GROUP EVENTS.

15. IN PRIVATE CONVERSATION WITH BUCHHEIM, TIMERBAEV, SAID THAT SOVIET SIDE WOULD LIKE TO HAVE US DESCRIBE ITS VERIFICATION NEEDS UNDER "THE HYPOTHESIS" THAT CONTAINED PNES WOULD BE LIMITED TO 100 KILOTONS.

16. IN PRIVATE CONVERSATION WITH JOYCE, KOCHETKOV INDICATED SATISFACTION THAT US SIDE HAD MADE "FIRST CONCRETE PROPOSAL" OF NEGOTIATIONS. HE CONTINUED THAT SOVIET SIDE OPPOSED IN PRINCIPLE LIMITS ON PNES, BUT WOULD NEVERTHELESS BE "GLAD TO DISCUSS" THE 100 KILOTON LIMIT ON CONTAINED EXPLOSIONS.
STOESSEL

SECRET

NNN

Message Attributes

Automatic Decaptioning: Z
Capture Date: 01 JAN 1994
Channel Indicators: n/a
Current Classification: UNCLASSIFIED
Concepts: TTBT, OEXD, PEACEFUL NUCLEAR EXPLOSIONS, NEGOTIATIONS, MEETING REPORTS
Control Number: n/a
Copy: SINGLE
Draft Date: 29 OCT 1974
Decaption Date: 28 MAY 2004
Decaption Note: 25 YEAR REVIEW
Disposition Action: RELEASED
Disposition Approved on Date:
Disposition Authority: boyleja
Disposition Case Number: n/a
Disposition Comment: 25 YEAR REVIEW
Disposition Date: 28 MAY 2004
Disposition Event:
Disposition History: n/a
Disposition Reason:
Disposition Remarks:
Document Number: 1974MOSCOW16496
Document Source: CORE
Document Unique ID: 00
Drafter: n/a
Enclosure: n/a
Executive Order: X3
Errors: N/A
Film Number: D740308-0883
From: MOSCOW
Handling Restrictions: n/a
Image Path:
ISecure: 1
Legacy Key: link1974/newtext/t19741010/aaaaaicg.tel
Line Count: 237
Locator: TEXT ON-LINE, ON MICROFILM
Office: ACTION SS
Original Classification: SECRET
Original Handling Restrictions: EXDIS
Original Previous Classification: n/a
Original Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Page Count: 5
Previous Channel Indicators:
Previous Classification: SECRET
Previous Handling Restrictions: EXDIS
Reference: n/a
Review Action: RELEASED, APPROVED
Review Authority: boyleja
Review Comment: n/a
Review Content Flags:
Review Date: 10 JUN 2002
Review Event:
Review Exemptions: n/a
Review History: RELEASED <10 JUN 2002 by rowelle0>; APPROVED <12 MAR 2003 by boyleja>
Review Markings:

Declassified/Released
US Department of State
EO Systematic Review
30 JUN 2005

Review Media Identifier:
Review Referrals: n/a
Review Release Date: n/a
Review Release Event: n/a
Review Transfer Date:
Review Withdrawn Fields: n/a
Secure: OPEN
Status: NATIVE
Subject: TTBT/PNE NEGOTIATIONS - SUMMARY OF OCT 29 PLENARY PNE MESSAGE NUMBER THIRTY-SIX
TAGS: PARM, US, UR
To: STATE
Type: TE
Markings: Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 30 JUN 2005